

# Research Methods in computer science

Spring 2017

Lecture 6

Omprakash Gnawali  
February 6, 2017

# Agenda

HW2 Live Grading

Paper Review

Assignment

# Which papers are more important?

Conference

Journal

Magazine

What makes a paper more important than others?

# Critique

Critique is a method of disciplined, systematic analysis of a written or oral discourse. Critique is commonly understood as fault finding and negative judgment, but it can also involve merit recognition, and in the philosophical tradition it also means a methodical practice of doubt. – (Wikipedia)

# Parts of a Research Paper

Abstract

Introduction

Related Work

Design and Implementation

Evaluation

Conclusion

*An Evaluation of the Ninth SOSP Submissions or  
How (and How Not) to Write a Good Systems  
Paper* by Roy Levin and David D. Redell

*How NOT to review a paper The tools and  
techniques of the adversarial reviewer* by  
Graham Cormode

# Adverserial Tactics

Goldilocks Method

Skipping parts that are “uninteresting”

Silent but deadly

Language comments

Moving Goalposts

Blind reviewing

# Adversarial View...

Abstract

Introduction

Related Work

Design and Implementation

Evaluation

Conclusion

# Classes of papers

Survey

New algorithms

New datasets

New applications of old ideas

Model/theory/understanding

# Criteria for Evaluation

Original Ideas

Reality

Lessons

Choices

Context

Focus

Presentation

# Coping with Criticism

Keep it professional

Don't take it personally

Understand it

Respond at the right time

Challenge as appropriate

<http://ckscience.co.uk/candidate/career-zone/work-place-advice/5-ways-to-deal-with-criticism-at-work/>

Do unto others as you would have them do to you. – (lots of places)

# A Paper Review

“While the exercise is useful, the paper does not have any new concepts or implementation caveats that I think are worth publishing. All of the design description seems straightforward integration of existing systems. The evaluation is also very weak.”

--- excerpt from a review received by the instructor

# A Paper Review

“Despite the limited practical applicability, I find the paper interesting for the sheer courage to try something out of the ordinary and to properly explore its limits.”

-- excerpt from a review received by the instructor

# How to Review a Paper?

- Form and Content
- Parts of a paper
  - What do you expect in each paper?

# How to Review a Paper? - Considerations

Novelty

Importance

Generality

Rigor

Insights

We looked at a few examples of paper reviews.

# HW3 – Important Related Work

Identify important papers in your area of research.

Rewrite related work in a published paper and improve it.