Research Methods in computer science
Spring 2017

Lecture 6

Omprakash Gnawali
February 6, 2017
Agenda

HW2 Live Grading
Paper Review
Assignment
Which papers are more important?

Conference
Journal
Magazine

What makes a paper more important than others?
Critique

Critique is a method of disciplined, systematic analysis of a written or oral discourse. Critique is commonly understood as fault finding and negative judgment, but it can also involve merit recognition, and in the philosophical tradition it also means a methodical practice of doubt. – (Wikipedia)
Parts of a Research Paper

Abstract
Introduction
Related Work
Design and Implementation
Evaluation
Conclusion
An Evaluation of the Ninth SOSP Submissions or How (and How Not) to Write a Good Systems Paper by Roy Levin and David D. Redell

How NOT to review a paper The tools and techniques of the adversarial reviewer by Graham Cormode
Adverserial Tactics

Goldilocks Method
Skipping parts that are “uninteresting”
Silent but deadly
Language comments
Moving Goalposts
Blind reviewing
Adversarial View...

Abstract
Introduction
Related Work
Design and Implementation
Evaluation
Conclusion
Classes of papers

Survey
New algorithms
New datasets
New applications of old ideas
Model/theory/understanding
Criteria for Evaluation

Original Ideas
Reality
Lessons
Choices
Context
Focus
Presentation
Coping with Criticism

Keep it professional
Don’t take it personally
Understand it
Respond at the right time
Challenge as appropriate

http://ckscience.co.uk/candidate/career-zone/work-place-advice/5-ways-to-deal-with-criticism-at-work/

Do unto others as you would have them do to you. – (lots of places)
A Paper Review

“While the exercise is useful, the paper does not have any new concepts or implementation caveats that I think are worth publishing. All of the design description seems straightforward integration of existing systems. The evaluation is also very weak.”

--- excerpt from a review received by the instructor
A Paper Review

“Despite the limited practical applicability, I find the paper interesting for the sheer courage to try something out of the ordinary and to properly explore its limits.”

-- excerpt from a review received by the instructor
How to Review a Paper?

• Form and Content

• Parts of a paper
  – What do you expect in each paper?
How to Review a Paper? - Considerations

Novelty
Importance
Generality
Rigor
Insights
We looked at a few examples of paper reviews.
HW3 – Important Related Work

Identify important papers in your area of research.

Rewrite related work in a published paper and improve it.