

Research Methods in computer science

Spring 2025

Lecture 14

Omprakash Gnawali

March 5, 2025

Agenda

Conference updates

Paper review

HW7

Reviewing a research paper

Usefulness of Learning How to Review

Look at your paper as a reviewer

Answer potential reviewer questions

Reviewer psychology

Review a few to get a feel for it

Critique

Critique is a method of disciplined, systematic analysis of a written or oral discourse. Critique is commonly understood as fault finding and negative judgment, but it can also involve merit recognition, and in the philosophical tradition it also means a methodical practice of doubt. – (Wikipedia)

Coping with Criticism

Keep it professional

Don't take it personally

Understand it

Respond at the right time

Challenge as appropriate

<http://ckscience.co.uk/candidate/career-zone/work-place-advice/5-ways-to-deal-with-criticism-at-work/>

Do unto others as you would have them do to you. – (lots of places)

A Paper Review

“While the exercise is useful, the paper does not have any new concepts or implementation caveats that I think are worth publishing. All of the design description seems straightforward integration of existing systems. The evaluation is also very weak.”

--- excerpt from a review received by the instructor

A Paper Review

“Despite the limited practical applicability, I find the paper interesting for the sheer courage to try something out of the ordinary and to properly explore its limits.”

-- excerpt from a review received by the instructor

How to Review a Paper?

- Form and Content
- Parts of a paper
 - What do you expect in each paper?

How to Review a Paper? - Considerations

Novelty

Importance

Generality

Rigor

Insights

Rigor in Computer Science

Thorough

Accurate

Well-established standards

Review Typical Template

Summary

Strengths

Weaknesses

Detailed Comments

Justification for these sections?

HW7

System (Design)

Describe your system or approach in about one page.